The following material complements and extends Chapter 9: '"Over the Sea to Skye": The Cultural Memory of Flora MacDonald in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Scotland' by Kirsteen McCue and Kate Mathis, with Julianna Wagar in *Shaping Jacobitism, 1688 to the Present: Memory, Culture, Networks*, co-edited by Leith Davis and Kevin J. James (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2025), pp. 127–41.

James Hogg's Songs about Flora MacDonald: A Case Study

Kirsteen McCue and Kate Louise Mathis

Our chapter in *Shaping Jacobitism* explores the literary retelling and reimagining of Flora MacDonald's role in Charles Stuart's escape from Culloden in 1746 – in Scots, English and, least often, in Gaelic – showing the complexity of interaction between contemporary Gaelic and Lowland sources and tracing the hinterlands of the popular depiction of MacDonald in the now-ubiquitous 'Skye Boat Song', which first appeared in volume 1 of Harold Boulton and Annie C. MacLeod's collection *Songs of the North* in 1885.

The chapter begins by examining eyewitness accounts of MacDonald and the story of Charles Stuart's formative voyage to Skye from Robert Forbes's manuscript notebooks 'The Lyon in Mourning', begun in the late 1740s, which include detailed accounts from many Gaelic speakers (reported to Forbes in English via usually unnamed intermediaries' translations of original testimony).[1] In our chapter, we contrast such informants' accounts with a newly recovered manuscript description of MacDonald from c. 1802 by a female, Gaelic-speaking eyewitness to Charles Stuart's arrival in Skye: Anne MacAlister, daughter to his host, MacDonald of Kingsburgh. In two documents written originally for her family, MacAlister attempted to redress several already contentious anecdotes that sentimentalised MacDonald's largely practical relationship with Charles Stuart during and after their voyage.[2] That such correction was required may well be as a result of MacDonald's role in one of the earliest semi-fictional accounts of Charles Stuart's experience after Culloden, the novella *Alexis; Or, the Young Adventurer* (1746), of which several late-1740s translations exist.[3] Its English-language translation appears to have been the work of MacDonald's cousin, stridently Jacobite Gaelic poet Alasdair Mac Mhaighstir Alasdair MacDhòmhnaill (Alexander MacDonald, c. 1698–c. 1770), who also contributed to a factual account of Charles Stuart's voyage given to Forbes (with which *Alexis* contrasts significantly). Among similar contemporary depictions of MacDonald, such as *The Female Rebels* (1747),[4] it is her representation in *Alexis* as 'Heroica' that promotes MacDonald as the charmingly determined

[1] Unless otherwise stated, all subsequent citations from 'The Lyon in Mourning' refer to the copy of Forbes's manuscript (National Library of Scotland, Adv. MS 32.6.16–26) digitised by Simon Fraser University (https://digital.lib.sfu.ca/lyon-mourning), included in-text as (volume number: folio number(s)).

[2] Printed in Archibald MacDonald, *Memorials of the '45* (Inverness: Northern Counties Newspaper Printing and Publishing Co., 1930), Appendix B.

[3] See Leith Davis, *Mediating Cultural Memory in Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2022), 231–5, and Murray Pittock, 'Charles Edward Stuart', *Études Écossais* 10 (2005): 59.

[4] *The Female Rebels: Some Remarkable Incidents of the Lives, Characters, and Families of the Titular Duke and Dutchess of Perth, the Lord and Lady Ogilvie, and of Mifs Florence McDonald* (Edinburgh, s.n., 1747).

Jacobite heroine seen so often in later, romanticised accounts by Anne Grant, James Hogg and Walter Scott in the first decades of the nineteenth century.

The second part of the book chapter focuses on the influence of Gaelic sources on the growing popularity of anglophone representations of MacDonald, beginning with examination of the Jacobite songs collected, edited and embellished by James Hogg (1770–1835) in the two volumes of his *Jacobite Relics of Scotland* (1819; 1821). Exploration of Hogg's alleged Gaelic sources for two songs featuring MacDonald leads, via discussion of the influential work of Gaelic poetry anthologist John MacKenzie (Iain Alastair Òig, 1806–48), to a fuller interrogation of the creative inspiration for Boulton's famous 'Skye Boat Song', published in 1885. We argue that the complex, often opaque interactions between Lowland and Gaelic textual representations of MacDonald across the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries influence and culminate in Boulton's song as a new site of MacDonald's cultural memory.

The two songs about Flora MacDonald from the Second Series of Hogg's *Jacobite Relics* of 1821 are mentioned briefly in the second part of the book chapter. Our examination of these two songs analyses, more closely than has previously been the case, Hogg's claim that Gaelic sources underlie his depiction of MacDonald, revealing an intimate and creative relationship between Gaelic and Scots song traditions (and printed anthologies with still-living Gaelic oral culture) in the early nineteenth century. A more detailed account and reading of Hogg's two 'Flora' songs and their potential influence by Gaelic tradition than was possible in the book chapter is given in the following discussion (which supplements, but should be read alongside, our fully contextualised argument in *Shaping Jacobitism*).

* * *

By the early 1800s, while growing fascination with Flora MacDonald was not limited to non-Gaels, her role in Charles Stuart's escape from Culloden received markedly different attention in non-Gaelic texts. Very few female-voiced or female-authored Gaelic songs are known to have addressed *Bliadhna Theàrlaich* (the 'Year of Charles', 1745–6),[5] and the most extensive praise of MacDonald by a contemporary Gaelic poet appears to have occurred in Iain mac Fhearchair's (John MacCodrum, c. 1693–1779) eulogy to her husband, Allan, composed c. 1766, the closing verses of which are addressed, conventional to the Gaelic panegyric code, to its primary subject's wife (that is, to Flora):

> Chuir Dia taghadh cèile ort
> Rinn maise 's fèill ri dàimh;
> Rinn an gnìomh bu smioraile
> Rinn bean a tha no bha
> Le barrachd uaisle 's rìoghalachd
> Ghluais i anns na gnìomharan
> Thug seanchas buan do linneachan
> Air chuimhn' an dèidh a bàis.

[5] Discussed by Ronald Black, 'The Ear of the Beholder: John MacKenzie of The Beauties', *Scottish Studies* 39 (2022): 125–6, and William Gillies, 'Gaelic Songs of the "Forty-Five"', *Scottish Studies* 30 (1991): 19–59.

God has given you a choice mate
Who has entertained guests with beauty and hospitality;
She has done the most doughty deeds
Of any other woman to date;
With great nobility and regality
She has performed great feats
Which will live long in the oral tradition
Of generations after her death.[6]

As Michael Newton observes, relevant to MacCodrum's merely subtle allusion to MacDonald's 'doughty deeds', Gaelic oral tradition 'has not memorialized Flora to the degree that it has her husband, or many of the other characters involved in [*Bliadhna Theàrlaich*]'.[7]

In contrast, the romanticisation of Flora MacDonald is shaped most clearly by the Jacobite song tradition that flourished in Lowland Scotland from the early nineteenth century. Gathering material for *Waverley* (1814), whose 'Flora MacIvor' derives 'from tales of those ardent women who supported Charles', Walter Scott had learned of selected Gaelic pro-Stuart songs from his regular correspondents, the Maclean Clephane sisters of Torloisk – none of which refer to MacDonald.[8] Overall, the popular corpus of songs devoted to MacDonald is non-Gaelic. An especially fine example is found in the Second Series of Hogg's *Jacobite Relics*. Hogg's commission from the Highland Society of London to collect and edit *Relics* during the late 1810s was a pivotal moment in the authorisation of Jacobite song.[9] Murray Pittock observes that, by this time, 'Hogg was a contributor to a revived tradition'.[10] *Relics* appeared on the cusp of George IV's visit to Edinburgh in 1822, when both tartan and the – by-now safely cauterised – Jacobite past had begun to be incorporated into royal-approved mainstream culture. *Waverley*, Scott's first novel, was a suitable precursor, and he was also heavily involved in the pageantry surrounding George IV's visit,

[6] Translated by Michael Newton, *We're Indians Sure Enough: The Legacy of the Scottish Highlanders in the United States* (Auburn, NH: Saorsa Media, 2001), 38–40. A song on MacDonald's marriage to Allan, equally specific to its context, may also be extant, and a brief eulogy attributed to Niall MacEachan, one of Charles Stuart's post-Culloden companions; see Keith Norman MacDonald, *MacDonald Bards From Mediaeval Times* (Edinburgh: Norman Macleod, 1900), 118, and MacDonald, *Memorials of the '45*, 109–12.
[7] *We're Indians*, 38. It may be notable, however, that MacDonald appears to have been the only woman whom MacCodrum's poetry addressed directly; see Archibald MacDonald, *The Uist Collection: The Poems and Songs of John MacCodrum* (Glasgow: Archibald Sinclair, 1894), xii–xiii.
[8] Kathryn Sutherland, 'Walter Scott's Highland Minstrelsy and his Correspondence with the Maclean Clephane Family', *Scottish Literary Journal* 9.1 (1982): 55–60; Karen E. McAulay, 'The Accomplished Ladies of Torloisk', *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 44.1 (2013): 57–78.
[9] See Murray Pittock, ed., *James Hogg: The Jacobite Relics of Scotland*, First Series (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002) and Second Series (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003). To this day, alongside Campbell's *Highland Songs of the Forty-Five* (1933), it remains the single most important printed source of Jacobite song.
[10] *Jacobite Relics*, First Series, xii.

for which Hogg wrote his 'mask' *The Royal Jubilee*, featuring several Jacobite songs and tunes.[11]

As Pittock observes, after claiming over-supply of songs for the First Series of *Relics* (1819), Hogg suggested he had struggled to collect quite so many for the Second, thereby tinkering more with the songs in this volume, especially with those claimed as 'translations' from the Gaelic. Fourteen of the songs in the Second Series fall into this category and their popularity was such that Hogg would include several in his selection of his best and most popular work in *Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* in 1831. Flora MacDonald is central to two of those *Relics* labelled by Hogg as 'from the Gaelic': song LXXXVIII, 'Prince Charles and Flora Macdonald's Welcome to Sky [*sic*]', and song XCII, 'The Lament of Flora Macdonald'.[12] While John Lorne Campbell was unable to 'discover one original [Gaelic] version' of either song,[13] Hogg's presentation of them as rooted in Gaelic tradition may yet reveal something of a process of mediation between both orality and print culture and contemporary Gaelic and Lowland song traditions.

In 'Prince Charles and Flora MacDonald's Welcome to Sky', Hogg's 'Flora' is not merely titular: she appears as 'my honey' in the opening line of its second verse and is described as 'So tear and so ponny'. To date, critics and editors have suggested that, due to its awkwardly artificial 'Highland' accent, the song is most likely Hogg's own creation: 't' replaces 'th' or 'd' and 'p' replaces 'b'. Hogg, however, states categorically in the song's accompanying note that his source was the singing of one Mrs Betty Cameron, observed in her obituaries to have hailed from Lochaber but who spent the last sixty years of her life in Edinburgh.[14] She was known for her 'abundant store of information and anecdote concerning the principal families of Scotland, as well as of the young Chevalier [Charles Stuart], whom she had seen in her youth', and it was claimed that in her eighty-fifth year 'she danced a reel, and [had] sung till lately, with great spirit, the pibrochs that were sounded at the "rising"'.[15] Hogg refers to Cameron in 1807 in the first of his three memoirs, where he suggests that they met initially in the 1790s when he embarked on collection of his earliest poems, songs and

[11] *James Hogg: The Bush Aboon Traquair and The Royal Jubilee*, ed. Douglas Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 113–97. A rehearsed reading of Hogg's 'Scottish Mask', as he subtitled *The Royal Jubilee*, was recorded to mark its 200th anniversary in December 2022 at the Scottish Poetry Library: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TdTRR3jgVts> (accessed July 2025).
[12] Respectively, *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 172–4 and *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 179–80.
[13] *Highland Songs of the Forty-Five* (Edinburgh: John Grant, 1933; reprinted Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press Ltd, 1984), xxi (n. 1).
[14] *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, XXXIII (December 1819), Vol. VI, 360; *The Edinburgh Magazine and Literary Miscellany* (December 1819), 584, summarised by MacDonald, *MacDonald Bards*, 118.
[15] *Edinburgh Magazine and Literary Miscellany*, 584. The pibroch/*piobaireachd* is a specific genre of pipe tune, often stately and ceremonial in character and featuring a main theme (*ùrlar*) and series of variations on that theme. See Francis Collinson, *The Traditional and National Music of Scotland* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1966), chapter VI, and William Lamb, 'Reeling in the Strathspey: The Origins of Scotland's National Music', *Scottish Studies* 36 (2013): 66–102.

ballads.[16] In his note to 'Prince Charles and Flora MacDonald's Welcome to Sky', Hogg claims it was:

> Copied verbatim from the mouth of Mrs Betty Cameron from Lochaber; a well-known character over a great part of the Lowlands, especially for her great store of Jacobite song, and her attachment to Prince Charles, and the chiefs that suffered for him, of whom she never spoke without bursting out a-crying. She said it was from the Gaelic; but if it is, I think it is likely to have been translated by herself. There is scarcely any song or air that I love better.[17]

While an extant Gaelic lyric has still to be identified,[18] this may yet be Cameron's translation of a song in her repertoire, with Hogg's addition of a contrived Gaelicised accent (perhaps explicable, more kindly, as an attempt to capture Cameron's spirited performance). The song addresses several (otherwise fictitious) 'maidens' accompanying Charles Stuart on the voyage to Skye, paying particular attention to MacDonald and 'Bettie Burke' (Charles Stuart, in disguise as MacDonald's maid). Its second verse refers to MacDonald's beauty and to 'Bettie' as 'one tat is tall,/and comely withal', presenting them as 'Khing' and 'qhuain' who are welcomed to 'Skhee again'. Female strength is emphasised in its third verse, in which the narrator observes: 'I will watch o'er te mhain'. The final verse, with its reference to the boat as a cradle, so often included in lyrical responses to MacDonald's voyage with Charles Stuart, encodes the song as a lullaby, concluding:

> Come along, come along,
> Wit your poatie and your song,
> My two ponny maytens,
> And tree ponny maytens:
> More sound shall you sleep,
> When you rock on te deep;
> And you's ay pe welcome
> To Skhee akain.

Also remarkable in Hogg's presentation of the song is its extensive editorial note. Many of his notes for *Relics* are brief, but this example runs to some eleven pages in which Hogg recounts the story of Charles Stuart's 'meeting with Flora Macdonald' and 'the time he remained under her protection'. Nick Smith's recent work on Hogg's editing of *Relics* suggests persuasively that, with this process, Hogg was in fact narrating his own 'history' of the 'Rebellion', in relation to his placing of songs across the paired volumes of *Relics* and through the content of his notes or commentary. In the case of the 'Welcome to Sky', Hogg

[16] Hogg claims that Betty Cameron's stories were the basis of his ballad 'Glengyle', and likewise that she provided the plot of his pastoral 'The Happy Swains'; *The Mountain Bard* (Edinburgh and London: Constable and Murray, 1807), xii. Hogg's earliest collection was *Scottish Pastorals* (1801).
[17] *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 357. As far as may be ascertained, the air to which Hogg refers is a variant of an Irish reel called 'Planxty George Brabazon', linked to the Irish harper Turlough O'Carolan (d. 1738).
[18] Observed even by 1900 in MacDonald, *Macdonald Bards*, 118.

clearly wishes to underline this element of Charles Stuart's journey as central and influential to his ultimate escape and also chooses to draw significant attention to MacDonald's role in its success. Smith's close analysis of Hogg's note to the song reveals that Hogg often incorporates quotations from, as well as paraphrasing, three key contemporary texts: Ralph Griffith's *Ascanius; or The Young Adventurer* (1746); the then-anonymous *A Genuine and True Journal of the Miraculous Escape of the Young Chevalier* now attributed to John Burton (1749); and George Charles's *History of the Transactions in Scotland, in the Years 1715–16, and 1745–46*, published just prior to *Relics* in 1817.[19] While Hogg's reliance on these sources is invisible to his readers, his note observes eventually that his account has been influenced by his knowledge of the journal of Charles Stuart's aide 'O'Neil'[20] and '[MacDonald of] Kingsborough [sic], his lady, and Miss Flora Macdonald'.[21] Although Hogg was acquainted with John Home's *History of the Rebellion in the Year 1745* (1802), an important witness to early mediations of MacDonald's role in Charles Stuart's escape, this particular grouping of eyewitnesses suggests Hogg is also relying on the same assortment of testimony compiled by Robert Forbes in 'The Lyon in Mourning' (cf. 1: 126–54).[22]

Hogg's description of the voyage to Skye was equally indebted to the at least partial 'hearsay' of MacDonald's admiring female fans during her captivity in Edinburgh in 1747, gathered and mediated by Forbes in 'The Lyon in Mourning' (1: 189–218). Hogg's note, like Forbes's 'Remarks', presents MacDonald and the boat's sailors as 'uneasy at their situations' during a storm-lashed crossing until Charles Stuart sang to them and told 'merry stories' to 'keep up their spirits'. He describes MacDonald as being 'so fatigued that she fell asleep in the bottom of the boat' and 'Charles observing it, covered her to save her as much as he could

[19] Smith is currently completing his PhD on Hogg and the Highlands at the University of Exeter. The longer version of *Ascanius; or, The Young Adventurer, a True History, etc*., by Ralph Griffiths, was published in London (T. Johnstone) in 1746. Griffiths's text incorporated a shorter, anonymous narrative with the same title published earlier that year (G. Smith). His 'expanded edition' is interpreted by Leith Davis as 'framing the pro-Jacobite story of Charles Edward Stuart's escape within a pro-Hanoverian history' (*Mediating Cultural Memory*, 235). Numerous editions of *Ascanius* appeared subsequently; comparisons with Hogg's note are with the edition dated 1804, which Hogg is likely to have seen. Burton's *A Genuine and True Journal of the Most Miraculous Escape of The Young Chevalier, From the Battle of Culloden, to his Landing in France* was published anonymously (By an Englishman) in London in 1749; the copy in the Royal Collection dates from 1754. Burton, a York-based antiquarian, had been held under house arrest after Culloden in the same London property as Flora MacDonald, and supplied Robert Forbes with MacDonald's own description of the voyage to Skye. George Charles's *History* was published for him in Stirling (printed in Alloa by J. Fraser and Co.) in 1817. In October that year, Hogg was approached (after correspondence between Colonel Stewart of Garth and the Edinburgh song editor George Thomson), on behalf of the Highland Society of London, about the possibility of editing *Relics* (Pittock, ed., *Jacobite Relics*, First Series, xix–xx).

[20] Captain Felix O'Neill, for whom see Ronald Black, *The Campbells of the Ark: Men of Argyll in 1745. Volume I: The Inner Circle* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 2017), 142. O'Neill's unreliable testimony on the subject of Charles Stuart's experiences after Culloden is also complained of by Forbes in 'The Lyon in Mourning' (1: 189).

[21] *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 368.

[22] For the circulation of Forbes's manuscripts prior to their receipt by Robert Chambers c. 1830, see Harry M. Lewis, 'The "Lyon in Mourning": Robert Forbes's Papers and Early Jacobite Studies, 1775–1926', *The International Review of Scottish Studies* 47 (2022): 42–4. Forbes's compilation derived from another of John Burton's documents.

from the cold and sat by her, lest any thing should hurt her, or lest any of the boat-men, in the dark, should trample upon her; but the sea was so rough that she did not sleep long.'[23] None of Hogg's editorial creativity, however, discounts the possible influence of Betty Cameron's song. Hogg's personified 'Flora', arguably influential to anglophone depictions thereafter (notably Harold Boulton's), is otherwise presented as resourceful and as a clever, manipulative politician who endures considerable hardship during her assistance of Charles Stuart yet remains determined, despite captivity and interrogation, to ensure the likelihood of his successful escape.

A moment that receives significant attention in nineteenth-century anglophone accounts of Charles Stuart's relationship with MacDonald (but very little elsewhere, notably in Gaelic sources) is the moment of their parting, when Charles Stuart sets sail for France. The second of Hogg's Flora songs in the Second Series of *Relics* imagines her anguish, now alone, at Charles Stuart's final departure from Skye. In contrast to Hogg's former insistence on verbatim acquisition from oral performance, moreover, he is keen to promote this song, 'The Lament of Flora Macdonald', as his own composition. While presented in *Relics* with the subtitle 'From the Gaelic', it is specified as Hogg's creation in numerous self-selected publications between 1819 and his death in 1835, after which it is one of a group of Hogg's songs that finds its place in general collections of Scots song (both text-only and with musical notation) published throughout the nineteenth century.[24] In its editorial note in *Relics*, Hogg states:

> I got the original of these verses from my friend Mr Niel Gow, who told me they were a translation from the Gaelic, but so rude that he could not publish them, which he wished to do on a single sheet, for the sake of the old air. On which *I versified them anew*, and made them a great deal better without altering one sentiment.[25]

By 'rude', Gow is likely to have meant crudely transcribed, since no corresponding Gaelic song of the bawdy kind is evident and since Hogg's lyric itself shows no trace of such origins.[26] The 'Lament', with a memorable new tune by Gow, opens sentimentally with Hogg's 'Flora' sitting alone 'down by the correi that sings to the sea', with 'dew on her plaid, and the tear in her e'e'. Her solitude is clearly subsequent to Charles Stuart's departure: Flora sings as she watches the corsair *L'Heureux* safely carrying 'Charlie' away to France. It is

---

[23] *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 360.

[24] For additional detail on the subsequent musical settings of the 'Lament', see Kirsteen McCue, ed., *James Hogg: Contributions to Musical Collections and Miscellaneous Songs* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014), 701–2, and *James Hogg: Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014), 7–8.

[25] *Jacobite Relics*, Second Series, 179–80, n. 369 (emphasis added). Hogg's song had appeared earlier, c. 1819, as a song-sheet with musical notation published in Edinburgh by Niel Gow's son Nathaniel. Marketed as a song with forte-piano or harp accompaniment, it is arguably directly influenced by Flora MacIvor's singing with her harp in Scott's *Waverley* (1814). A recording of this version may be found on the James Hogg Research website: <https://jameshogg.stir.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Lament.mp3> (accessed July 2025). In *Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* (1831) and its associated manuscript, Hogg titles it 'Flora Macdonald's Farewell'.

[26] Pittock comments that 'there are at least three major kinds of Jacobite song, the militant/aggressive, the erotic and the sacred', claiming that Hogg's *Jacobite Relics* includes examples of only the first two (*Jacobite Relics*, First Series, xv).

arguable that Harold Boulton knew Hogg's 'Lament', for lines 5 and 6 of Hogg's song – 'She look'd at a boat wi' the breezes that swung/Away on the wave, like a bird of the main' – bear close resonance both to Hogg's 'Prince Charles and Flora Macdonald's Welcome to Sky' (verse 3) and to Boulton's famous opening line for the 'Skye Boat Song': 'Speed bonnie boat, like a bird on the wing'. The second verse of Hogg's 'Lament' paints a detailed picture of the Highland landscape with reference to its native birds: the moorcock, eagle, solan and cormorant, all comfortable in their homes while there is no place of rest for the would-be king. To close the 'Lament', Hogg produces a verse heavily reminiscent of James Macpherson's *Poems of Ossian*:

> The target is torn from the arm of the just,
> The helmet is cleft on the brow of the brave,
> The claymore for ever in darkness must rust,
> But red is the sword of the stranger and slave;
> The hoof of the horse, and the foot of the proud,
> Have trod o'er the plumes on the bonnet of blue.
> Why slept the red bolt in the breast of the cloud,
> When tyranny revell'd in blood of the true?
> Fareweel, my young hero, the gallant and good!
> The crown of thy fathers is torn from thy brow!

While the Gaelic original of the song supplied by Gow remains mysterious, Hogg's 'Lament' may be connected to the song 'Dealachadh a' Phrionnsa ri Fionnghul Nic-Dhomhnuill' (beginning 'Gu cladach a' chuain' ['To the shore of the ocean']), which, while perhaps in earlier circulation orally, first enters print twenty years after Hogg's text in John MacKenzie's *Eachdraidh a' Phrionnsa, no Bliadhna Theàrlaich [The History of the Prince, or Charles's Year]*, published in 1844.[27] MacKenzie identifies Brora-born poet Donald B. MacLeòid (d. 1849), apparently his assistant with compiling his groundbreaking anthology *Sar-Obair nam Bàrd Gaelach [The Beauties of Gaelic Poetry]*, as its composer.[28] The first verses of Hogg's 'Lament' and MacLeòid's 'Dealachadh' have some notable similarities. MacLeòid's fourth line, 'Bu trom air a h-osna' ['Heavy her sigh'], reflects Hogg's depiction of his Flora sighing mournfully, and two lines later MacLeòid's 'Nuair a chunnaic i'n iùbhrach' ['When she saw the vessel'] also refers, as in Hogg's opening verse, to her glimpsing a boat. While Hogg's 'Lament' itself may simply have inspired MacLeòid to compose an equivalent song in Gaelic, it is also possible that

[27] See Black, 'Ear of the Beholder', 133–4. The same 'Dealachadh' was also reprinted in MacKenzie's second engagement with *Bliadhna Theàrlaich*: *An t-Aosdàna, or, A Selection of the Most Popular Gaelic Jacobite Songs, &c.*, also in 1844. *Eachdraidh a' Phrionnsa* represents MacKenzie's partial translation of Robert Chambers's popular *History of the Rebellion in Scotland in 1745–6*, published initially in 1827, commissioned after its fifth edition had appeared in 1840. MacKenzie's representation of MacDonald is discussed fully in the chapter in *Shaping Jacobitism* that this case study of Hogg's songs supports.

[28] W. C. MacKenzie and Niall MacKenzie, 'Nova Scotian and Old World Bards', *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 21 (2003): 148. *Sar-Obair*, which ran to multiple editions, was published initially in 1841. It was the first collection of (still-untranslated) Gaelic songs to include headnotes in English; see generally Black, 'Ear of the Beholder', 110–28.

'Dealachadh', reframed as Charles Stuart's parting conversation with MacDonald, responded to 'Oran Araid' ('A certain song'), composed in the late 1740s by Mac Mhaighstir Alasdair.[29] 'Oran Araid', also included by MacKenzie in *Eachdraidh a' Phrionnsa*, gives voice to Gaels complaining that Charles Stuart's departure is leaving them behind. In its verses, Mac Mhaighstir Alasdair had directed Charles Stuart's gratitude specifically towards Clan Donald, whose 'ever-willing followers' ('lean sibh deònach rium gach tràth'), like the Flora in MacLeòid's song, receive praise for having ensured the success of his escape. While the vocabulary shared by 'Oran Araid' and MacLeòid's 'Dealachadh' referring to Charles Stuart's ship may be coincidental, it is also notable that both songs' bereft speakers refer to Charles Stuart's absence as the loss of their 'tiller' (*stiùir*) and 'pole-star' (*reul-iùil/iùlmhor*).

While, as yet, little else is known about MacLeòid's song or its potential connection to Hogg's 'Lament', some form of mediation between them may be implied. For the third volume of his *Songs of the North* series, Harold Boulton composed yet another 'Prince Charlie's Farewell to Flora' (also, remarkably, translated into Gaelic by a contemporary poet).[30] Boulton's song is set to an 'Old Highland Air' attributed to Robert MacLeod (it is clearly an *iorram* – a rowing song – as its chorus clarifies). In Boulton's 'Farewell', which begins prior to Charles Stuart's departure but otherwise has much in common with Hogg's sentimental style, 'Charlie' bids a tender goodbye to 'Flora' ('pure soul of womanhood,/white rose of loyalty'), whose bravery is compared to those who fought for 'Charlie' and who now guide him to safety. Her 'image will abide' in memory while 'Scotland sighs for freedom gone', but 'Charlie' notes that his and Flora's names will 'roll on' and 'live entwined for ever'. This line in Boulton's text also resonates with the final verse of a 'Song in praise of Miss Flora MacDonald' that Forbes had included in 'The Lyon in Mourning' (5: 881–2):

> O happy nymph! thou sav'dst the Prince;
> Thy fame be handed down.
> Thy name shall shine in annals fair
> And live from sire to son.

Hogg's 'Lament' has its own resonance. Its chorus concludes with the line: 'Farewell to the lad I shall ne'er see again', a nice foregrounding of Carolina Oliphant's later refrain: 'Will ye no' come back again', one of her many sentimental and popular Jacobite lyrics printed around 1850.[31] While it is almost impossible to propose defining evidence for any direct links between these songs – Hogg's, MacLeòid's, Oliphant's and Boulton's – such similarities

---

[29] Campbell, *Highland Songs*, 86–93, previously entitled 'Dealachadh a' Phrionnsa 's nan Gaidheal' ['The parting of the Prince from the Gaels'] by the MacDonald brothers (*The Poems of Alexander MacDonald* [Inverness: Northern Counties Newspaper and Printing Company, 1924]).

[30] *Songs of the North*, III, no. 15, 84–8. The translator, an Alister Macdonald, used the title 'Dealachadh a Phrionnsa le Fionnghal', a possible nod to MacLeòid's song. See our chapter in *Shaping Jacobitism* for fuller contextualisation of Boulton's song and its translation into Gaelic, which appears to reflect Boulton's growing familiarity with the language and its song tradition between the publication of the first and third volumes in his *Songs of the North* series (the third of which has a dedicated Gaelic editor, Neil Shaw).

[31] Carolina Oliphant, *Lays from Strathearn* (Edinburgh: Paterson and Sons, c. 1850), 6–7. There are numerous 'editions' and reprintings of this collection with music by Finlay Dun, ranging from c. 1850–c. 1860.

imply, at least, that some osmotic process both underlies and connects contemporary Gaelic and Scots oral and literary cultures and their respective song traditions by the late nineteenth century, and that some shared sense of imagery and textual inflection underpins Flora MacDonald's legacy as a loyal, brave and true Jacobite heroine, much beloved by Charles Stuart.